## ON POINTWISE-COMPACT SETS OF MEASURABLE FUNCTIONS

G. A. Edgar Department of Mathematics The Ohio State University Columbus, OHIO 43210/U.S.A.

The result proved below concerns a convex set of functions, measurable with respect to a fixed measure, and compact in the topology of pointwise convergence. The first and most interesting theorems along these lines were proved in [6] and [7] by A. Ionescu Tulcea. Several alternate proofs have been given since that time-for example [8]. The case of nonconvex sets was studied by Fremlin [4] and by Talagrand [10].

For the result proved here, I weaken the "separation property", and correspondingly weaken the conclusion, using the weak topology  $\sigma(L^1, L^{\infty})$  rather than the metric topology of  $L^1$  or  $L^0$ . The result is then applicable to the proof of the recent characterization of Pettis integrability in terms of the "core".

The following notation will be fixed throughout the paper. Let  $(\Omega, \mathbf{3}, \mu)$  be a complete probability space.  $\mathcal{L}^{O} = \mathcal{L}^{O}(\Omega, \mathbf{3}, \mu)$  denotes the set of all realvalued measurable functions.  $L^{O} = L^{O}(\Omega, \mathbf{3}, \mu)$  denotes the space of equivalence classes obtained by identifying functions that agree almost everywhere. Similar distinctions apply to  $\mathcal{L}^{1}$ ,  $L^{1}$ ,  $\mathcal{L}^{\infty}$ ,  $L^{\infty}$ . The topology on  $\mathcal{L}^{O}[$  or  $L^{O}]$  is induced by the pseudometric [or metric] defined by

 $d(f, g) = \int |f - g| \wedge 1 d\mu$ .

If A is a subset of  $\Omega$ , the topology (on  $\mathbb{R}^{\Omega}$ ) of pointwise convergence on A will be denoted  $\tau_p(\mathbf{A})$ . Thus a net  $f_{\alpha}$  of functions converges to f according to  $\tau_p(\mathbf{A})$  iff  $f_{\alpha}(\mathbf{a}) \rightarrow f(\mathbf{a})$  for all  $\mathbf{a} \in \mathbf{A}$ . If W is a subset of  $\mathfrak{L}^{O}$ , we write  $(W, \mathfrak{L}^{O})$  for the topological space with point set W and topology obtained from the pseudometric on  $\mathfrak{L}^{O}$ . Similarly, if  $W \subseteq \mathfrak{L}^{1}$ , we write  $(W, \mathfrak{L}^{1})$  and  $(W, \sigma(\mathfrak{L}^{1}, \mathfrak{L}^{\infty}))$  for W equipped with the strong and weak topologies (respectively) of  $\mathfrak{L}^{1}$ .

The following hypotheses will be in effect through most of this paper: Let W be a subset of  $\mathcal{L}^{O}$ . Let  $E \subseteq \Omega$ . Suppose the following <u>separation property</u> holds: If f, g  $\in$  W, then f = g on E if and only if f = g a.e.

To reduce confusion, I will also use these two notations. Let  $W_1 = \{f|_F :$ 

 $f \in W \} \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{E}$ , and let  $W_{2}$  be the image of W under the quotient map  $\mathfrak{L}^{0} \to L^{0}$ . The separation property says that the identity map  $W \to W$  induces a bijection  $W_{1} \to W_{2}$ .

The first proposition is essentially due to Ionescu Tulcea. The proof is carefully spelled out here to show exactly the sort of reasoning that is involved.

PROPOSITION 1. Suppose W and E are as above. If W is  $\tau_p(\Omega)$  - countably compact, then W<sub>2</sub> is closed in L<sup>0</sup> and the evaluations  $f \mapsto f(e)$  are  $\mathfrak{L}^0$ -continuous on W for  $e \in E$ . That is, the identity map  $(W, \mathfrak{L}^0) \to (W, \tau_p(E))$  is continuous.

<u>Proof.</u> Let  $f_n \in W$ , and assume  $f_n + f(\mathfrak{L}^0)$ . There is a subsequence  $(f'_n)$  with  $f'_n + f(a.e.)$ . But W is  $\tau_p(\Omega)$ -countably compact, so  $(f'_n)$  has a cluster point  $g \in W$  for the topology  $\tau_p(\Omega)$ . Thus f = g a.e. This shows  $W_2$  is closed in  $L^0$ .

Now fix  $e \in E$ . Suppose  $f_n$ ,  $f \in W$  and  $f_n + f(\mathfrak{L}^0)$ . I claim that  $f_n(e) + f(e)$ . Suppose not. Then there is a subsequence  $(f'_n)$  of  $(f_n)$  so that  $f'_n(e)$  converges, but not to f(e). Then there is a subsequence  $(f''_n)$  of  $(f'_n)$  such that  $f''_n + f(a.e.)$ . Let  $g \in W$  be a  $\tau_p(\Omega)$ -cluster point of  $(f''_n)$ . Then  $g(e) = \lim f'_n(e) \neq f(e)$ , while  $g = \lim f''_n = f$  a.e., contradicting the separation property. This shows  $f \mapsto f(e)$  is  $\mathfrak{L}^0$ - continuous on W.

<u>Note.</u> Suppose the measure space  $(\Omega, \mathfrak{F}, \mu)$  has this property: if  $(f_n)$  is a sequence in  $\mathfrak{L}^0$ , and every subsequence has a measurable  $\tau_p(\Omega)$  - cluster point, then there is a subsequence that converges a.e. In that case, in the above proposition, the identity map  $(W, \mathfrak{L}^0) \rightarrow (W, \tau_p(E))$  is a homeomorphism. Fremlin [4] has shown that all perfect measure spaces have this property.

In the next theorem, the case  $E = \Omega$  was proved by Ionescu Tulcea [6]. PROPOSITION 2. Suppose W and E are as above. If W is  $\tau_p(\Omega)$  - sequentially compact, then the natural map  $(W_1, \tau_p(E)) \rightarrow (W_2, L^0)$  is a homeomorphism. So the identity map  $(W, \tau_p(\Omega)) \rightarrow (W, \mathcal{L}^0)$  is continuous.

<u>Proof.</u> First, I claim that  $W_2$  is compact in  $L^0$ . Let  $f_n \in W$ , and suppose  $f_n \rightarrow h(\mathfrak{L}^0)$ . There is a subsequence  $(f_n')$  of  $(f_n)$  with  $f_n' \rightarrow h$  (a.e.). There is a subsequence  $(f_n'')$  of  $(f_n')$  and  $g \in W$  with  $f_n'' \rightarrow g(\tau_p(\Omega))$ . Then h = g a.e. Thus  $(W_2, L^0)$  is compact.

Next, since  $(W, \tau_p(\Omega))$  is sequentially compact, it is countably compact, so by Proposition 1, the natural map  $(W_2, L^0) \rightarrow (W_1, \tau_p(E))$  is continuous. But  $(W_2, L^0)$  is compact and  $(W_1, \tau_p(E))$  is Hausdorff, this natural map is a

homeomorphism.  $\Box$ A set  $W \subseteq \mathfrak{L}^0$  is <u>uniformly integrable</u> iff for every  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists  $a < \infty$  so that

$$\int_{\{|\mathbf{f}| > a\}} |\mathbf{f}| d\mu < \varepsilon$$

for all f  $\in$  W . In particular, W is bounded in the  $\mathfrak{L}^{1}$  norm.

Here is the main result of the paper. Its proof is not difficult.

PROPOSITION 3. Suppose W and E are as above. If W is convex, uniformly integrable, and  $\tau_p(\Omega)$  - countably compact, then the two topologies  $\tau_p(E)$  and  $\sigma(\mathfrak{L}^1, \mathfrak{L}^{\infty})$  coincide on W. So the identity map  $(W, \tau_p(\Omega)) \rightarrow (W, \sigma(\mathfrak{L}^1, \mathfrak{L}^{\infty}))$  is continuous.

<u>Proof.</u> Let e ∈ E and r ∈ R. The (image in W<sub>1</sub> of the) set {f ∈ W: f(e) ≤ r) is closed in (W<sub>1</sub>,  $\tau_p(E)$ ), and hence, by Proposition 1, closed in (W<sub>2</sub>, L<sup>1</sup>). It is therefore closed in (L<sup>1</sup>, L<sup>1</sup>). But it is convex, so it is closed in (L<sup>1</sup>,  $\sigma(L^1, L^{\infty})$ ), and therefore closed in (W<sub>2</sub>,  $\sigma(L^1, L^{\infty})$ ). Similar assertions can be made for a set {f ∈ W: f(e) ≥ r}. Thus the map f ↔ f(e) is  $\sigma(L^1, L^{\infty})$ continuous on W<sub>2</sub>. Thus the natural map (W<sub>2</sub>,  $\sigma(L^1, L^{\infty})$ ) → (W<sub>1</sub>,  $\tau_p(E)$ ) is continuous. Now W is uniformly integrable and W<sub>2</sub> is closed in L<sup>1</sup>, so (W<sub>2</sub>,  $\sigma(L^1, L^{\infty})$ ) is compact [1, IV.8.11]. So the map (W<sub>2</sub>,  $\sigma(L^1, L^{\infty})$ ) → (W<sub>1</sub>,  $\tau_p(E)$ ) is a homeomorphism, and thus the identity map (W,  $\sigma(\mathfrak{L}^1, \mathfrak{L}^{\infty})$ ) → (W,  $\tau_p(E)$ ) is a homeomorphism. □

<u>Notes.</u> (a) It follows in particular that  $(W_1, \tau_p(E))$  is sequentially compact.

(b) Under these hypotheses it does not follow in general that the topologies  $\mathfrak{s}^{1}$  and  $\sigma(\mathfrak{s}^{1}, \mathfrak{s}^{\infty})$  coincide on W. A counterexample of Talagrand [10] is also a counterexample to this.

(c) The stronger conclusion that the topologies  $\mathfrak{L}^{1}$  and  $\tau_{p}(E)$  coincide on W is true if the measure space  $(\Omega, \mathfrak{F}, \mu)$  has this property: if  $(f_{n})$  is a sequence in  $\mathfrak{L}^{0}$ , and every  $\tau_{p}(\Omega)$ -cluster point of  $(f_{n})$  vanishes a.e., then  $f_{n} \neq 0$  in measure. Fremlin's theorem [4] shows that perfect measure spaces have this property.

The proofs of the following two corollaries are left to the reader. Corollary 4 is essentially due to Ionescu Tulcea [7] .

COROLLARY 4. Suppose W and E are as above. Suppose that  $E = \Omega$  and that W is convex and  $\tau_p(\Omega)$  - countably compact. Then the two topologies  $\tau_p(\Omega)$  and  $\mathfrak{L}^0$ coincide on W. If, in addition, W is uniformly integrable, then the three topologies  $\tau_n(\Omega)$ ,  $\mathfrak{L}^1$ ,  $\sigma(\mathfrak{L}^1, \mathfrak{L}^\infty)$  coincide on W.

The "separation hypothesis" on W and E is not postulated in the next Corollary.

COROLLARY 5. Let W be a uniformly integrable, convex,  $\tau_p(\Omega)$  - compact subset of  $\mathfrak{L}^1$  . Define

$$A = \bigcap \{ \omega \in \Omega : f(\omega) = g(\omega) \}$$

where the intersection is over all pairs f,  $g \in W$  with f = g a.e. Assume that  $A \cap \{w: f(w) \neq g(w)\} \neq \emptyset$  if f,  $g \in W$  and  $\mu\{w: f(w) \neq g(w)\} > 0$ . Then the identity map  $(W, \tau_p(\Omega)) \rightarrow (W, \sigma(\mathcal{L}^1, \mathcal{L}^\infty))$  is continuous. In particular, for any  $B \in \mathfrak{F}$ , the map  $f \mapsto \int_B f d\mu$  is  $\tau_p(\Omega) - continuous on W$ .

The following Corollary is due to Tortrat [11] .

COROLLARY 6. Let X be a Banach space, **3** the Baire sets of (X, weak), and  $\mu$  a probability measure on **3**. If  $\mu$  is  $\tau$ -smooth, then there is a separable subspace A of X with  $\mu$ -outer measure 1.

<u>Proof.</u> Let W be the unit ball of the dual space  $X^*$ . Define  $A = \bigcap \{f^{-1}(0): f \in W, f = 0 \text{ a.e.}\}$ . Then by  $\tau$ -smoothness, A has outer measure 1. By Corollary 4, with  $E = \Omega = A$ , the topologies  $\tau_p(A)$  and  $\mathfrak{L}^0$  coincide on W. Thus  $(W, \tau_p(A))$  is metrizable, so the weak<sup>\*</sup> topology on the dual ball of A is metrizable, so the subspace A is separable.  $\Box$ 

<u>Note.</u> From this can be deduced well-known theorems of Gothendieck and Phillips; see [2, Theorem 5.1].

The following is a result of Talagrand; partial results were proved by Geitz [5] and by Sentilles [9].

PROPOSITION 7. Let X be a Banach space, and  $\varphi: \Omega \to X$  scalarly measurable. Assume {fog:  $f \in X^*$ ,  $||f|| \le 1$  } is uniformly integrable. Suppose  $\operatorname{cor}_{\varphi}(C) \neq \emptyset$ for all  $C \in \mathcal{F}$  with  $\mu(C) > 0$ , where

 $\operatorname{cor}_{co}(C) = \bigcap \{ \operatorname{cl} \operatorname{conv} \varphi (C \setminus \mathbb{N}) : \mathbb{N} \in \mathfrak{F}, \mu(\mathbb{N}) = 0 \}$ .

Then  $\varphi$  is Pettis integrable.

<u>Proof.</u> Consider a measure space  $(\Omega', \mathfrak{F}', \mu')$  defined by:  $\Omega' = X$ ,  $\mathfrak{F} = \text{Baire } (X, \text{ weak}), \mu' = \varphi(\mu)$ . Let W be the unit ball of  $X^*$ ; this is a convex, uniformly integrable, subset of  $\mathfrak{L}^O(\Omega', \mathfrak{F}', \mu')$ . By Alaoglu's theorem [1, V.4.2], W is  $\tau_p(\Omega')$ -compact. Define A as in Corollary 5; in this case, A is the intersection of all closed hyperplanes of measure 1. This implies that  $\operatorname{cor}_{\mathfrak{G}}(\Omega) \subseteq A$ .

Let  $f \in X^*$ ,  $\mu \{f = 0\} < 1$ . There is  $\varepsilon > 0$  so that either  $\mu \{f > \varepsilon\} > 0$ 

or  $\mu\{\mathbf{f} < -\epsilon\} > 0$ ; assume without loss of generality that the first of these occurs. For  $C = \{\mathbf{f} \ge \epsilon\}$ , if  $x \in \operatorname{cor}_{\varphi}(C)$ , then  $f(x) \ge \epsilon$ , so  $A \cap \{\mathbf{f} \neq 0\} \neq \emptyset$ . So Corollary 5 is applicable. Thus the map  $f \leftrightarrow \int f d\mu'$  is  $\tau_p(\Omega')$  - continuous, so  $f \leftrightarrow \int f \circ \varphi d\mu$  is weak<sup>\*</sup> - continuous, and the Pettis integral  $\int \varphi d\mu$  exists. The same argument shows that the Pettis integral  $\int_{C} \varphi d\mu$  exists for any  $C \in \mathfrak{F}$ .

Remarks. (a) In the terminology of [2], property (C) implies the PIP. (b) In the notation used above, the unit ball of A is  $W_1$ , and  $(W_1, \tau_p(A))$  is the weak\* topology there. This is homeomorphic to  $(W_2, \sigma(L^1, L^{\infty}))$ , which is clearly an Eberlein compact. So the subspace A is isomorphic to a subspace of a WCG Banach space. However, A need not be separable.

## **REFERENCES:**

- 1. N. Dunford and J. T. Schwartz, <u>Linear Operators, Part I.</u> Interscience, New York, 1957.
- G. A. Edgar, Measurability in a Banach space. <u>Indiana Univ. Math. J.</u> 26(1977) 663-677.
- G. A. Edgar, Measurability in a Banach space, II. <u>Indiana Univ. Math. J.</u> 28 (1979) 559-579.
- D. H. Fremlin, Pointwise compact sets of measurable functions. <u>Manuscripta Math.</u>, 15(1975) 219-242.
- 5. R. F. Geitz, Geometry and the Pettis Integral. (preprint)
- A. Ionescu Tulcea, On pointwise convergence, compactness and equicontinuity in the lifting topology, I. <u>Z. Wahrscheinlichkeitstheorie und Verw. Gebiete</u> 26 (1973) 197-205.
- A. Ionescu Tulcea, On pointwise convergence, compactness, and equicontinuity, II. Advances in Math. 12(1974) 171-177.
- L. Schwartz, Certaines propriétés des mesures sur les espaces de Banach. <u>Semi-</u> naire Maurey-Schwartz 1975-1976, exposé no XXIII.
- 9. D. Sentilles, Stonian integration of vector functions. In: <u>Measure Theory and Appl., Proc. 1980 Conf., Northern Illinois University</u>, G. A. Goldin and R. F. Wheeler, eds., De Kalb, Illinois, 1981. pp. 123-135.
- M. Talagrand, Compacts de fonctions mesurables et filtres non measurables. <u>Stu-</u> <u>día Math.</u> 67(1980) 13-43.
- A. Tortrat, τ régularité des lois, séparation au sens de A. Tulcea et propriété de Radon-Nikodym. Ann. Inst. Henri Poincaré, Sect. B, 12(1976) 131-150.